Non-degree equatives and reanalysis*

Julia Bacskaia-Atkari
University of Potsdam
julia.bacskaia-atkari@uni-potsdam.de

13th International Conference on the Structure of Hungarian (ICSH13)
Budapest, 29–30 June 2017

1 Introduction

equative markers in German non-degree equatives (similatives; cf. Haspelmath & Buchholz 1998) and degree equatives:

(1)  
   a. Maria ist **so groß wie** ihre Mutter.  
      Mary is **so tall as** her F mother  
      ‘Mary is as tall as her mother.’
   
   b. Maria ist **so wie** ihre Mutter.  
      Mary is **so as** her F mother  
      ‘Mary is like her mother.’
   
   c. Maria ist groß **wie** ihre Mutter.  
      Mary is **tall as** her F mother  
      ‘Mary is tall like her mother.’

same complementiser (*wie*) in the subclause (↔ differences between *as* and *like*)

matrix equative marker (*so*):

- takes the *wie*-CP as its complement (cf. Lechner 2004 for comparatives; see also von Stechow 1984 on the arguments of matrix comparative/equative heads)
- takes a gradable argument (AP) in its specifier in degree equatives (cf. Lechner 2004 for comparatives) but not in non-degree equatives
- absence of equative marker also results in a non-degree reading – (1c)

*This research was funded by the German Research Fund (DFG), as part of my project “The syntax of functional left peripheries and its relation to information structure”. The participation at the conference is supported by a travel grant from the Potsdam Graduate School.
similar distribution in Hungarian:

(2) a. Mari olyan magas, mint az anyja.
    Mary so tall as the mother.POSS
    ‘Mary is as tall as her mother.’

b. Mari olyan mint az anyja.
    Mary so as the mother.POSS
    ‘Mary is like her mother.’

c. Mari magas, mint az anyja.
    Mary tall the mother.POSS
    ‘Mary is tall like her mother.’

both wie and mint complementisers (see Jäger 2010; 2016, Bacskai-Atkari 2014a)

(3) a. EquatP
    (AP) Equat’
    \[\text{Equat CP so } C’\]
    \[\text{C … wie}\]

b. EquatP
    (AP) Equat’
    \[\text{Equat CP olyan } C’\]
    \[\text{C … mint}\]

degree equatives: QP (Bacskai-Atkari 2014b, based on Lechner 1999)

(4) a. QP
    \[\text{Q’ so AP Equat’}\]
    \[\text{groß Equat CP ti } C’\]
    \[\text{C … wie}\]

b. EquatP
    \[\text{Equat CP so } C’\]
    \[\text{C … wie}\]
but: doubling patterns differ in the two languages

German: als wie dialectally and historically (see Jäger 2016; see also Eggs 2006, Lipold 1983, Weise 1918)

(5) a. Dei Schweinsbraan schmeggd genau a so fad als wie dei Schbinad your roast.pork tastes exactly PRT so stale than as you spinach
‘Your roast pork tastes just as stale as your spinach.’ (Bavarian)
(Jäger 2016: 260, ex. 541a, citing Merkle 1975: 171)

b. Das es akkerate su als wie bei eich.
that.N is accurate so as as by you.PL.DAT
‘It is accurate, as is at your place.’ (Thuringian)
(Jäger 2016: 261, ex. 541c)

Modern Hungarian: mint followed by an overt operator (Kenesei 1992, Bacskaia-Tkari 2014a;b)

(6) a. Mari olyan magas, mint amilyen (magas) az anyja.
Mary so tall as how tall the mother.POSS
‘Mary is as tall as her mother.’

b. Mari olyan mint amilyen az anyja.
Mary so as how the mother.POSS
‘Mary is like her mother.’

structures:

(7) a. \[\text{EquatP} \quad \text{(AP)} \quad \text{Equat’} \quad \text{Equat CP so C’} \quad \text{CP Als Op C’} \quad \text{C}
\quad \text{Wie \ldots} \]

b. \[\text{EquatP} \quad \text{(AP)} \quad \text{Equat’} \quad \text{Equat CP olyan C’} \quad \text{C CP mint amilyen C’} \quad \text{C}
\quad \text{\ldots} \]

canonical equative complementiser: located in different positions in German and Hungarian – question: why and to what extent this is related to the historical development of the two elements
proposal:

- doubling in German: due to reanalysis of *als* from the matrix clause to the subclause
- doubling in Hungarian: due to overt realisation of the comparative operator lower than the complementiser itself
- difference structural and not parametric – evidence from Old Hungarian: similar constructions possible in non-degree equatives

## 2 Equatives in German

original pattern: *als* ((al)so) the original equative complementiser – present in Old High German equatives already, replaced by *wie* during Early New High German (from the second half of the 16th century onwards), see Jäger (2010)

regular West-Germanic pattern:

- *as*/so in degree equatives and non-degree equatives
- matrix equative element *as*/so

present-day patterns:

(8) a. Ralph is **as tall as** Peter.

b. Sophie is **zo groot als** Lieke.
   Sophie is so tall as Lieke
   ‘Sophie is as tall as Lieke.’

c. Ralf **ist so groß wie** Peter.
   Ralph is so tall as Peter.
   ‘Ralph is as tall as Peter.’

etymology:

- English: *as* derives from *allsua* (*all + so*), forms *swelce* (*swilce, such*) and *so* (*swa*) also possible historically in *as*-constructions (see Kortmann 1997: 315–317; see also López-Couso & Méndez-Naya 2014: 312–314 and references there)
- German: *als* derives from Old High German *also* (*all + so*), various forms of *so* possible historically in *as*-constructions (see Jäger 2010)
- Dutch: *als* derived from *also* (*al + so*)

→ elements *so* and *as* are essentially the same (either as matrix elements or as complementisers), later differentiation/changes naturally possible
German: *wie* an innovation – reanalysis from operator in the specifier into a grammaticalised C head, in line with general economy principles ("comparative cycle" in Jäger 2010; 2016, based on the "relative cycle" of Van Gelderen 2004; 2009; see also the arguments of Bacskaí-Atkari 2014a)

former periods of German (before Early New High German): *as*-clause introduced by *als*
(examples from the beginning of the 12th century)

(9) a. wart aber ie só werder man geborn [...] só von Norwege Gåwân
  was.3sg but ever so noble.3m man born as from Norway Gawain
  ‘But was there ever born a man as noble as Gawain from Norway?’
  (*Parzival* 651, 8ff; Eggs 2006: 22–23, ex. 14)

  b. [...] waer er só milt als lanc, er hete tugende
  be.cond.3sg he so generous as tall he have.cond.3sg virtues
  vil besezzen
  many possess.inf
  ‘If he were as generous as he is tall, he would have had many virtues.’
  (Walther von der Vogelweide, *Werke* Bd. 1, 118f; Eggs 2006: 22, ex. 12)

  c. dochn was dá nieman alsó vrô alsó min her Gawein
  but was.3sg there noone so glad as my lord Gawain
  ‘but noone was as glad there as my Lord Gawain’
  (*Iwein* 2618f; Eggs 2006: 22, ex. 13)

question: diachronic relation of single *als*, single *wie* ad *als wie*

traditional view (see Jäger 2010): *als* → *als wie* → *wie*

but: diachronic evidence suggests a different process (Jäger 2016: 291–298): *als* → *wie* → *als wie*

original of *als* in *als wie*: matrix equative element, not the previous complementiser
(Jäger 2016)

change earlier in non-degree equatives, later in degree equatives (see Jäger 2016: 294)

reanalysis affecting the syntactic category – Hohaus & Zimmermann (2014): comparative constructions involving a maximality operator and a comparative operator in the semantics, neither is tied to a particular syntactic projection and to the notion of degree → certain flexibility in the syntax
structures (overt markers):

(10) a. \[ \text{EquatP} \quad \begin{array}{c}
\text{Equat'} \\
\text{Equat} \quad \text{CP} \\
\text{als} \quad \text{C'} \\
\text{C} \ldots \\
\text{wie}
\end{array} \]

b. \[ \text{CP} \quad \begin{array}{c}
\text{C'} \\
\text{C} \quad \text{CP} \\
\text{als} \quad \text{C'} \\
\text{C} \ldots \\
\text{wie}
\end{array} \]

reanalysis possible in non-degree equatives:

- no intervening AP in the construction (no QP – see (4) above)
- matrix equative element not necessary in similatives
- also: ambiguity/relatedness of matrix and subclausal equative elements (so/als(o))

once (10b) available, it can be extended to degree equatives (analogy)

3 Equatives in Old Hungarian

various elements attested in the subclause in similatives but only mint grammaticalised as a C head (Kántor 2013)

reanalysis of mint: standard reanalysis from specifier to head (economy principles, as for German wie; see Bacskaí-Atkári 2014a)

grammaticalisation of mint leading to the loss of the original complementiser hogy (see Bacskaí-Atkári 2014a):

(11) hogy → hogy mint → mint
etymology:¹

- **mint**: *mi* ‘what’ + -*n* (modal suffix) + -*t* (locative suffix)
- **miként**: *mi* ‘what’ + -*ként* (modal suffix; cf. Modern Hungarian *tanár-ként* ‘as a teacher’)
- **miképpen**: *mi* ‘what’ + -*képpen* (modal suffix consisting of *kép* ‘picture, likeness’ and the modal suffix -*n*)
- **monnal** – restricted option

corpus study: using the normalised part of the “Old Hungarian Concordance” corpus

number of hits (as of 23rd June 2017):

- **miképpen**: 738
- **mint**: 542
- **miként**: 478
- **monnal**: 189

→ **mint** not winning over other elements due to its higher frequency (hits include constructions other than non-degree equatives)

possible reasons:

- **mint** less transparent than **miképpen** and **miként** → more suitable for grammaticalisation, especially in degree equatives (cf. the difference between English *as* and *like* in terms of transparency)
- **monnal** restricted in its occurrence, probably available in certain dialects – in the normalised corpus: only in the Munich Codex and the Vienna Codex (closely related texts, parts of the “Hussite Bible”)

comparison of two Bible translations (gospels):

- Munich Codex: from 1466; contains the translations of the 4 gospels
- Jordánszky Codex: from 1516 and 1519; contains almost the entire New Testament and 7 books of the Old Testament

search: equivalents of the Latin non-degree equative markers *quasi* and *tamquam*

- **quasi** derives from *quam si* ‘as if’ but no longer transparent (see Tarríño 2011)
- **tamquam** derives from *tam* ‘so’ + *quam* ‘as’

¹The etymological data presented here are based on the following etymological dictionary: *Etymologisches Wörterbuch des Ungarischen*, edited by Loránd Benkő.
results for the Munich Codex:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>quasi</th>
<th>tamquam</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>mint</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>miként</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>monnal</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

results for the Jordánszky Codex:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>quasi</th>
<th>tamquam</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>mint</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>olymint</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ugy-mint</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>miképpen</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

_oly-mint_ ‘so-as’ and _uggy-mint_ ‘so.ADV-mint’ not Latin reflexes (most occurrences have _quam_ in the original) – also: independent examples in the Kazinczy Codex (from between 1526 and 1541)

examples for _miként_ and _mint_:

(12)  

a. mert vala okét taneito miként hatalmas & ně miket aʒ because was they.ACC teaching as great not as the iraʃtudoc & a lenaltac scribes the Levites ‘For He taught them as one having authority, and not as the scribes.’  
(Munich Codex 36va; Mark 1:22)

b. mert ţg tanoyttya vala hwhek, mynt kynek hatalma because so taught.3SG they.ACC as who.DAT power.POSS is vagyon rea, ęs nem mykeppen az yraʃthwdoκ it.SUBL and not as the scribes ‘For He taught them as one having authority, and not as the scribes.’  
(Jordánszky Codex 455; Mark 1:22)

c. et stupebant super doctrina eius erat enim docens eos and wondered.3PL on teaching his was.3SG truly teaching they.ACC quasi potestatem habens et non sicut scribae as power.ACC having and not like scribes ‘For He taught them as one having authority, and not as the scribes.’
examples for monnal and mint:

(13) a. Monda ke if ągocna cic o hoja iottc vala a said.3SG then Jesus those.DAT who.PL he to.him came.3PL be.PST the papoc feiédelmič / & a3 egha3 mešterińf & a priests chief.Poss.DAT the church captains.Poss.DAT the vènečč Kí iottetec en hojač mònal toluiho3 tòrockel & elders.DAT out came.2PL I.to.me as thief.ALL swords.INSTR rudackal megfoğnotoc èngemèt chubs.INSTR pre.čatch.INF.2PL I.ACC

‘Then Jesus said to the chief priests, captains of the temple, and the elders who had come to Him, “Have you come out, as against a robber, with swords and clubs?” ’

(Munich Codex 81vb; Luke 22:52)

b. Zola azert Jesu azoknak, kyk hw hozya yetteneck vala, az spoke.3SG thus Jesus those.DAT who.PL he to.him came.3PL be.PST the papy feyedelmek es templomnak meštery, es az veeneck: Vg priestly chieftains and church.DAT masters.Poss and the elders so yettetek mynt latorh0z fegywerekkel es dorongokkal came.2PL as thied.ALL weapons.INSTR and clubs.INSTR

‘Then Jesus said to the chief priests, captains of the temple, and the elders who had come to Him, “Have you come out, as against a robber, with swords and clubs?” ’

(Jordánszky Codex 609; Luke 22:52)

c. dixit autem Iesus ad eos qui venerant ad se principes said.3SG but Jesus to they.ACC who came.3PL to himself chiefs sacerdotum et magistratus templi et seniores quasi ad latronem priests.Gen and officials temple.Gen and elders as to thief.ACC existis cum gladiis et fustibus being with swords.DAT and clubs.DAT

‘Then Jesus said to the chief priests, captains of the temple, and the elders who had come to Him, “Have you come out, as against a robber, with swords and clubs?” ’

examples for miként and olymint:

(14) a. Es legottan felnmemen a vízból / lata mennekéket
    and immediately up.coming the water.ELA saw.3SG heavens.ACC
    megénitnuk & fent lelket miként galabat le űlnak & maradv
    PRT.opening sacred spirit.ACC as dove.ACC down flying staying
    oaita
    upon.him
‘And immediately, coming up from the water, He saw the heavens parting
and the Spirit descending upon Him like a dove.’
(Munich Codex 36rb; Mark 1:10)

b. Es legottan mynt ky yewe az vyzb’o1, lataa a’
    and immediately as out came.3SG the water.ELA saw.3SG the
    menyorzagot nythvan lenny, es yistennek zent lelket oly
    heaven.ACC open.PTCP be.INF and god.DAT sacred spirit.ACC so
    mynth galamb kepeben le zallany
    as dove picture.POSS.INE down descend.INF
‘And immediately, coming up from the water, He saw the heavens parting
and the Spirit descending upon Him like a dove.’
(Jordánszky Codex 454; Mark 1:10)

c. et statim ascendens de aqua vidit apertos caelos
    and immediately emerging from water sax.3SG open.PL.ACC heavens.ACC
    et Spiritum tamquam columbam descendentem et manentem in
    and spirit.ACC as dove.ACC descending.ACC and staying.ACC in
    ipso
    itself.ABL
‘And immediately, coming up from the water, He saw the heavens parting
and the Spirit descending upon Him like a dove.’

status of oly in the subclause – adjectival equative marker, could appear either as a pred-
icate or as an attribute but not as a verbal modifier – several other such occurrences
in the Jordánszky Codex

structural change similar to German – from Equat to C:

(15) a. EquatP
    ] Equat’
    ] Equat CP
    ] oly(an) CP
    ] mint
    b. CP
    ] C’
    ] C CP
    ] oly C’
    ] mint
reanalysis possible: adjacency (also: no movement to QP, see (4) above)
reanalysis accompanied by phonological reduction: strong form olyan does not appear in these constructions, weak form oly does (cliticises onto the next element, not stressed)

but: olymint (and ugymint) not extended to degree equatives ↔ German als wie

possible reasons:

- grammaticalisation of mint involves mint reinterpreted as an element located above the comparative operator, see (11) – conflict with doubling patterns involving oly-mint, ultimate loss of oly-mint with the appearance of overt comparative operators (Middle Hungarian)

- matrix equative marker necessary in degree equatives (taking the gradable predicate as an argument), oly surface-similar with eh matrix element oly(an) – exceptional in the Hungarian syntactic paradigm, unlike in West Germanic; also: redundancy (three equative markers altogether, as opposed to two in non-degree equatives)

4 Conclusion
equative markers in German and Hungarian – doubling patterns synchronically and diachronically

- non-degree equatives less grammaticalised than degree equatives – more (transparent) operator elements possible (Old Hungarian), operator takes over earlier (German)

- doubling patterns can involve the lexicalisation of an operator in a lower CP (Hungarian)

- doubling patterns can involve the reanalysis of the matrix equative element into the CP – categorial change (German, Old Hungarian)

- patterns may be extended analogically to degree equatives – but: relative position of the equative complementiser and the relation between the equative marker and the complementiser matter (transparency)

differences between the two languages can be drawn back to more general properties, not parametric in nature
References


